

Illinois State Bar Association JUDICIAL EVALUATIONS 2022 Primary Election

Candidates seeking election to the Illinois Appellate or Supreme Courts are reviewed in a comprehensive evaluation process. This involves a detailed background investigation by members of the ISBA Judicial Evaluations Committee-Outside Cook County, followed by an in-person interview of the candidate. The Committee then decides whether to issue a rating of “Highly Recommended,” “Recommended” or “Not Recommended” for candidates seeking to fill a vacancy. Ratings based on these judicial evaluations are the opinion of the Illinois State Bar Association. Ratings for the Appellate and Supreme Court candidates (outside of Cook County) running in the June 28, 2022 Primary Election are below.

5th Judicial District, Appellate Court		
<i>Includes Circuits 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 20 and 24. The following counties fall under the Fifth Judicial District: Alexander, Bond, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Clay, Clinton, Coles, Crawford, Cumberland, DeWitt, Douglas, Edgar, Edwards, Effingham, Fayette, Franklin, Gallatin, Hamilton, Hardin, Jackson, Jasper, Jefferson, Johnson, Lawrence, Macon, Madison, Marion, Massac, Monroe, Montgomery, Moultrie, Perry, Piatt, Pope, Pulaski, Randolph, Richland, Saline, Shelby, St. Clair, Union, Vermillion, Wabash, Washington, Wayne, White, and Williamson.</i>		
Overstreet Vacancy		
	<u>Rating</u>	<u>Narrative</u>
<i>For Appellate Court</i> Mike McHaney	Not Recommended	

5th Judicial District, Appellate Court		
Overstreet Vacancy		
	<u>Rating</u>	<u>Narrative</u>
<p><i>For Appellate Court</i></p> <p>Brian Roberts</p>	<p>Not Recommended</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Brian Roberts</p> <p>Brian Roberts is a candidate for the position of Appellate Court Justice in the Fifth District of Illinois (now comprised of Alexander, Bond, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Clay, Clinton, Coles, Crawford, Cumberland, DeWitt, Douglas, Edgar, Edwards, Effingham, Fayette, Franklin, Gallatin, Hamilton, Hardin, Jackson, Jasper, Jefferson, Johnson, Lawrence, Macon, Madison, Marion, Massac, Monroe, Montgomery, Moultrie, Perry, Piatt, Pope, Pulaski, Randolph, Richland, Saline, Shelby, St. Clair, Union, Vermillion, Wabash, Washington, Wayne, White, and Williamson counties). Except when a circuit court’s decision may be appealed directly to the Illinois Supreme Court, a person has the right to appeal the decision to the Illinois Appellate Court. The appellate court is organized into five districts, each of which hears appeals from the circuits within that district.</p> <p>The Illinois State Bar Association’s Judicial Evaluations Committee – Outside Cook County evaluates judicial candidates for legal ability, experience, fairness, and judicial temperament, among other qualifications. Brian Roberts was offered the opportunity to participate in the ISBA Judicial Evaluations Committee’s investigation into his qualifications, but he untimely submitted his materials so that an investigation could not be completed. Without the timely cooperation of Brian Roberts, it is impossible for the Judicial Evaluations Committee to fully evaluate his qualifications. Therefore, the Judicial Evaluations Committee – Outside Cook County cannot recommend Brian Roberts for the office of Justice of the Fifth District Appellate Court for the State of Illinois.</p>

5th Judicial District, Appellate Court		
<i>Overstreet Vacancy</i>		
	<u>Rating</u>	<u>Narrative</u>
<p><i>For Appellate Court</i></p> <p>Barry L. Vaughan</p>	<p>Recommended</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Barry L. Vaughan</p> <p>Barry L. Vaughan is a candidate for the position of Appellate Court Justice in the Fifth District of Illinois (now comprised of Alexander, Bond, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Clay, Clinton, Coles, Crawford, Cumberland, DeWitt, Douglas, Edgar, Edwards, Effingham, Fayette, Franklin, Gallatin, Hamilton, Hardin, Jackson, Jasper, Jefferson, Johnson, Lawrence, Macon, Madison, Marion, Massac, Monroe, Montgomery, Moultrie, Perry, Piatt, Pope, Pulaski, Randolph, Richland, Saline, Shelby, St. Clair, Union, Vermillion, Wabash, Washington, Wayne, White, and Williamson counties). Except when a circuit court’s decision may be appealed directly to the Illinois Supreme Court, a person has the right to appeal the decision to the Illinois Appellate Court. The appellate court is organized into five districts, each of which hears appeals from the circuits within that district.</p> <p>Barry L. Vaughan was appointed as a justice on the Illinois Appellate Court in January 2021. Prior to his appointment to the appellate court, he served as Resident Circuit Judge in Hamilton County in the Second Circuit. Before becoming a judge, Barry L. Vaughan served as the Wayne County State’s Attorney from 1988 to 1996, and was also in private practice, and served as city/village attorney for several municipalities.</p> <p>The Illinois State Bar Association’s Judicial Evaluations Committee – Outside Cook County has reviewed a written submission by Barry L. Vaughan and has interviewed judges, court personnel and numerous lawyers from various areas of practice who know and have worked or practiced before him. Areas of inquiry and evaluation for the committee include litigation experience; legal knowledge and ability; other professional experience and activities; integrity; character; professional and judicial temperament; and health. Barry L. Vaughan also presented himself for an interview before a subcommittee of the Judicial Evaluations Committee.</p> <p>The Judicial Evaluations Committee - Outside Cook County finds Barry L. Vaughan to be Recommended for the position of Justice of the Fifth District Appellate Court for the State of Illinois.</p>

Illinois State Bar Association JUDICIAL ADVISORY POLLS 2022 Primary Election

The Illinois State Bar Association Judicial Advisory Poll is conducted electronically and by mail and is sent to all ISBA members in the circuit or district from which a candidate seeks election (except Cook County). Illinois licensed attorneys who are not members of the ISBA, or any Illinois licensed attorney outside the circuit or district, may request a ballot. Opinions expressed in the Poll are those of the attorneys who chose to respond to the Poll and their opinions do not reflect the opinions of the ISBA or the opinions of *all* Illinois attorneys.

Candidates are rated as “Recommended” or “Not Recommended” based on whether respondents agree that the candidate “meets acceptable requirements for the office.” Candidates must receive at least 65% “yes” responses to that question in order to be rated as “Recommended”. Percentage is based on "yes" responses to each question; "no opinion" responses are not included.

5th Judicial District, Appellate Court

Includes Circuits 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 20 and 24. The following counties fall under the Fifth Judicial District: Alexander, Bond, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Clay, Clinton, Coles, Crawford, Cumberland, Dewit, Douglas, Edgar, Edwards, Effingham, Fayette, Franklin, Gallatin, Hamilton, Hardin, Jackson, Jasper, Jefferson, Johnson, Lawrence, Macon, Madison, Marion, Massac, Monroe, Montgomery, Moultrie, Perry, Piatt, Pope, Pulaski, Randolph, Richland, Saline, Shelby, St. Clair, Union, Vermillion, Wabash, Washington, Wayne, White, and Williamson

	Number of Responses	Recommended/ Not Recommended	Meets Requirements Of Office	Integrity	Impartiality	Legal Ability	Temperament	Court Management	Health	Sensitivity
Appellate Court – Overstreet Vacancy										
Mike McHaney	210	NR	44.44	59.07	61.88	68.37	41.71	74.74	76.47	55.26
Brian Roberts	138	NR	51.56	61.90	62.60	66.67	69.29	58.47	58.97	77.31
Barry L. Vaughan	207	R	89.66	92.12	89.55	87.68	92.16	90.59	94.15	89.90

R Recommended NR Not Recommended * Insufficient number of responses

Opinions expressed are of those lawyers who chose to respond and not of the Illinois State Bar Association.

Fifth Judicial Circuit Clark, Coles, Cumberland, Edgar and Vermillion counties										
	Number of Responses	Recommended/ Not Recommended	Meets Requirements Of Office	Integrity	Impartiality	Legal Ability	Temperament	Court Management	Health	Sensitivity
<i>Garst Vacancy</i>										
Mark R. Isaf	*									
<i>Glenn Vacancy</i>										
Brian Bower	47	R	91.49	100	95.74	93.62	91.11	97.73	100	97.78
Cara Honselman Shoaff	36	R	75.00	85.29	84.85	67.74	85.29	90.63	96.88	93.75

R Recommended NR Not Recommended * Insufficient number of responses

Opinions expressed are of those lawyers who chose to respond and not of the Illinois State Bar Association.